

TURKEY

Author

Ø Human Resources Development Foundation - HRDF

TURKEY

I. Introduction

Situated at the northeast of the Mediterranean Sea in SE Europe and SW Asia, Turkey is a crossroad of many cultures. It is surrounded by the Black Sea to the north and the Aegean Sea to the west. Its neighbours are Greece and Bulgaria to the west, Russia, Ukraine and Romania to the north (through the Black Sea), Georgia, Armenia, Azerbaijan, and Iran to the east, and Syria and Iraq to the south.

Traditionally a country of emigration, Turkey increasingly became a point of attraction for irregular migration after the 1990s. Growing numbers of migrants from diverse backgrounds entered Turkey, mainly under the cover of tourism. While the majority of arrivals towards the end of the 1980s came from the Balkans, the composition changed with the collapse of the USSR and the nationals of the former Soviet republics, having encountered acute economic crisis and deteriorating living standards, became the main group of migrants in Turkey. In this context, Turkey became mainly a *destination country* for human trafficking.

The majority of documented cases involve women who were trafficked for purposes of forced prostitution. National statistics¹²⁰ show that most women trafficked to Turkey come from Moldova, Russia and the Ukraine. However, nationals of Kyrgyzstan, Uzbekistan, Romania, Azerbaijan, Kazakhstan, Turkmenistan, Georgia and Belarus are also identified as victims.

According to national statistics¹²¹, a total of 239 victims of trafficking have been identified by state authorities in 2004. This figure was 256 for 2005 and 138 for the first half of 2006. However, it is not possible to estimate the exact number of victims in Turkey. There are no recorded cases of Turkish victims trafficked abroad.

According to statistics of the *Human Resources Development Foundation* (HRDF) the majority (61%) of the victims, referred to HRDF's shelter, are between 18 and 24 years old. Victims in the age group of 25 to 30 represent 25,5 % of the victims and victims aged 30 and above represent 11% of the total number

¹²⁰ The General Directorate of Security, Department of Foreigners, Borders and Asylum Affairs, 'Combating Trafficking in Human Beings in Turkey' presentation distributed in a meeting, on file with the authors.

¹²¹ *Id.*

of victims. Identified minors represent 2,7 % of the total number of identified victims. Age statistics provided by the International Organization for Migration (IOM) are similar.

II. National Legal Framework

A. National law

The first legal provision that included the definition of Trafficking in Human Beings (THB) was Article 201/b of the *Penal Code*, which was revised in 2002. Art. 201/b called for heavy penalties for traffickers, including five to ten years of imprisonment.

The *new Penal Code of Turkey*, which entered into force on 01.06.2005, also includes the definition of THB (Article 80) and stipulates imprisonment of eight to twelve years and a legal fine corresponding to ten thousand days in prison. It also prescribes security measures for legal entities involved in THB.

Human Trading / Article 80;

- A person who procures or kidnaps or takes or transports persons from one place to another or harbours persons with the intention to force them to work or to provide a service or to subject them to slavery or similar practices or to remove their organs by exerting threats, pressure, force or violence, by abusing authority, by deceit or by obtaining their consent through taking advantage of the opportunities they have to control them or of their vulnerability, shall be sentenced to imprisonment for a term of eight to twelve years and to a judicial fine of up to ten thousand days in prison.
- The consent of the victim will be invalid in cases when the actions constituting the crime are performed with the aims mentioned in the first sub-paragraph.
- In the case of supplying persons under the age of 18 for the aims mentioned in the first sub-paragraph, as well as smuggling, moving or sending them from one place to another or sheltering them, the offender will be punished, as mentioned in the first sub-paragraph, regardless of having exerted threat, pressure, force or violence, or by abusing authority, or by deceit, or by obtaining their consent.
- Security precaution provisions will be applied to legal entities with respect to these crimes.

Comment

Evidence shows that, due to the limited definition utilised in Article 80 of the Penal Code, its application is not always possible. In such cases, Article 227¹²² concerning prostitution applies. Article 80 should be modified in order to cover all possible forms of human trafficking.

Other related laws and regulations

- According to the *Law on Working Permits for Foreigners*, the Ministry of Labour and Social Security is authorised to issue all forms of *working permits*. Employment in domestic services is possible under this Law. It aims at providing legal protection to foreigners against exploitation in the labour market and extends legal and administrative safeguards to private agreements. The Ministry of Labour and Social Security has prepared a model contract both in Turkish and in the native language of applicants.
- In accordance with the amendment of the *Citizenship Law*, a probation period of three years is required for acquiring *Turkish citizenship* through marriage. Those who have a

¹²² Prostitution/Article 227 - One who, instigates child to prostitution, facilitates it, procures or shelters or mediates for the prostitution of a child will be sentenced to prison terms of four years to ten years and fined up to five thousands days equivalent Turkish liras. Preparation acts are punished as the committed crime.

- One who instigates someone to prostitution, facilitates its way, or mediates for it, or guarantees the place where prostitution is practiced will be imprisoned from two to four years and fined up to three thousands days equivalent Turkish liras. Benefiting, partly or entirely, from the profits of a person who acts as a prostitute is regarded as instigation to prostitution.
- One who allows a person to get into the country and to get out from the country for the act of prostitution is punished in accordance with the above provisions.
- The above-mentioned punishments will be increased by half to twice the sentence for persons who procure or instigate someone to prostitution by using force or coercion or by abusing his/her misrepresentation or mistake.
- These punishments will be increased by half when the crimes are committed by the spouse, ascendants, ascendants in-law, brother (sister), adopting parent, guardian, educator, teacher, caretaker, by others who are under a duty of care and protection or committed by the abuse of power of public duty or service.
- These punishments will be increased by half in case the crime is committed within the framework of a crime organization.
- Private security precaution provisions will be applied to legal entities with respect to these crimes.
- One who acts as a prostitute will be treated or provided with therapy.

job incompatible with the institution of marriage and do not share the same house with their spouse will not be able to acquire Turkish citizenship.

- The *Road Transport Regulation*, which became effective as of 25.02.2004, states that the *transportation permit* will be cancelled for three years if the applicant is sentenced for certain crimes including human trafficking.
- The Ministry of Health has made necessary legislative and administrative changes in order to provide *free of charge medical treatment* at state-owned hospitals to victims of THB.
- The Ministry of Interior has authorised provincial administrative authorities to issue, where necessary, *humanitarian visas* and *temporary residence permits* to victims in order to allow them to stay in Turkey for rehabilitation and treatment. The duration of these permits is up to six months and can be extended.

B. Bilateral agreements

Turkey has signed 64 *Security Cooperation Agreements* with 52 countries for combating organised crime and terrorism. All agreements include provisions for cooperation against illegal migration and human trafficking. *Cooperation Protocols* have been proposed to Georgia, Bulgaria, Romania, Moldova, the Russian Federation, Azerbaijan, Belarus, Uzbekistan and the Ukraine within this framework in order to activate the relevant clauses of the said agreements.

In the course of the last three years the Turkish Ministry of Interior signed the following *Memoranda of Understanding* with the Ministries of Interior of the following countries:

- Additional Protocol on Implementation of Article 1 of the Cooperation Agreement against Crime between the Government of the Republic of Turkey and the Government of the *Ukraine* (07.06.2005) and with *Moldova* (08.02.2006).
- Memorandum of Understanding between the Ministry of Interior of the Republic of Turkey and the Ministry of Internal Affairs of the Republic of *Belarus* on Cooperation in the field of Combating Trafficking in Human Beings and Illegal Migration (28.07.2004).
- Protocol between the Republic of Turkey and *Georgia* on the Implementation of the Ninth Article of the Agreement on Combating Terrorism, Organised Crime and Other Major

Crimes between the Republic of Turkey, Georgia and the Republic of *Azerbaijan* (10.03.2005).

These agreements include provisions facilitating the following areas:

- Information exchange on traffickers and victims;
- Investigative procedures including joint operations;
- Entitlement of victims to support services and facilitation thereof;
- general awareness-raising;
- Information on the development of the legislative framework in the field of trafficking in human beings and related areas.

C. National Action Plan

Adopted in 2003, the *Turkish National Action Plan* comprises twelve points of action to prevent and combat trafficking in human beings. A brief summary of the action plan follows:

- Establishment of shelters;
- Ensuring the safe return of victims of trafficking;
- Establishment of an emergency Hot Line, providing 24/7 free of charge services;
- Amendment of Article 5 of the *Citizenship Law* (No. 403)¹²³, according to which a probation period of three years will be required before acquiring Turkish citizenship;
- Humanitarian visa application for Victims of Trafficking (VoT);
- Participation of law enforcement bodies in anti-trafficking training projects;
- A special law on witness protection, which also includes trafficked victim-witnesses;
- The Ministry of Labour and Social Security is assigned as the sole competent authority to issue work permits for foreigners in Turkey (*Law on Work Permits for Foreigners*);¹²⁴
- NGOs are encouraged to engage in the fight against trafficking in human beings;
- Recording of detailed statistics by the General Directorate of Statistics and Criminal Record of the Ministry of Justice;

¹²³ The Law was approved by Parliament on 06.06.2003.

¹²⁴ Law No. 4817. The Law has been approved by Parliament on 27.02.2003.

- The treatment and rehabilitation of victims of trafficking is ensured;¹²⁵
- Support is provided to victims of trafficking, under the Law on Fund of Encouragement of Social Aid and Solidarity;
- Preparation of special informative placards on trafficking in human beings in order to raise awareness.

The Turkish Government is in the process of modifying the National Action Plan. A working group has been established, comprising representatives of NGOs active in the area as well as representatives of governmental bodies, to deal with the modification.

III. General Framework

A. Capacity building

A number of *training courses* have been organised for different target groups in Turkey; the main organisers are the Ministry of Interior (MoI), the International Organization for Migration (IOM) and the Human Resource Development Foundation (HRDF).

Target-Institutions	Number of participants	Organization providing the training
MoI-General Directorate of Security	148	MoI (in cooperation with TAIEX and ICMPD SP)
MoI-General Directorate of Security	154	HRDF
MoI-General Directorate of Security	81	IOM
MoI-General Commandership of Gendarmerie	256	ΔOM
MoI-General Commandership of Gendarmerie	36 students	IOM
Ministry of Justice	64	HRDF
NGOs and local authorities	75	IOM
Bar Association	81	IOM
Police Helpline Operators	34	IOM

The General Directorate of Security provides regular *in-service training* for its staff. Starting in 2004, modules relating to human trafficking were added in the in-service training

¹²⁵ Free of charge medical treatment according to Resolution No. 2003/6565 of the Council of Ministers of 05.12.2003.

curricula. A total of 332 police officers have participated in this training programme in 2004; the number of in service participants was 515 in 2005 and 201 in the first half of 2006.

In addition to the above-mentioned training, a number of *national workshops* and seminars have been organised by various organizations. NGO representatives, police officers, prosecutors and judges have also participated in a number of international seminars, workshops and training courses.

A number of *manuals* have been developed for combating human trafficking. Currently a study is being implemented in order to standardise the training modules, which will be used in law enforcement training.

THB Manual	Distributed in 2003 by the General Directorate of Security (GDS) to all provinces
International Centre for Migration Policy Development (ICMPD) Trainer's Manual	Developed and adapted through a series of workshops by ICMPD experts and used in ICMPD trainings
AGIS Trainer's Manual	Currently in the process of adaptation by the GDS.
Combating Trafficking In Persons (TIP) Manual	Developed and used by the General Commandership of Gendarmerie in their in-service trainings
Combating Human Trafficking (HT) Guide	Developed by the GDS, will be distributed to police stations throughout Turkey.

Comments

- The training of law enforcement officers should reach a larger number given the fact that government officers are obliged to change their posts regularly.
- Training should be continuous, and updated training should be scheduled, taking into account the progressive mechanisms of combating human trafficking and new instruments developed internationally.
- The standardization in the training modules should be ensured.

B. Analysis, research and monitoring mechanisms

The increase of the number of illegal migrants led to the establishment of a new department in the Ministry of Interior re-

sponsible for illegal migration (*Illegal Migration Office* in the Bureau for Foreigners, Borders and Asylum) in 1997. The Ministry of Foreign Affairs also established *Unit for Combating Illegal Immigration* in 2001. These two bodies are active in combating human trafficking in Turkey. Under the auspices of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, a *National Coordinator* for international cooperation and national coordination has been appointed for combating human trafficking. The *National Task Force* composed of experts from various ministries and non-governmental organizations was established and convened for the first time in October 2002. The *National Task Force to Combat Trafficking in Human Beings* meets twice a year. This multi-disciplinary and cross-sector forum monitors and reviews the implementation of anti-trafficking action in Turkey. If particular issues require special attention, *ad-hoc working groups* are convened to discuss and resolve the issues in question (e.g. shelter modalities, health issues, etc.).

The compilation of data and the information regarding human trafficking issues are insufficient in Turkey. No official report has been prepared so far. The government and non-governmental bodies prepare *reports for internal use*. IOM has prepared two national reports on human trafficking in Turkey so far. The first report was released in 2004 and the second in 2006.

Comments

- There is an absence of mechanisms of analysis, research and monitoring. The national mechanism to combat human trafficking should be restructured.
- Annual reports containing information on the number of identified victims, the services provided, the training aimed at government officers and the responsible authorities for different aspects of combating human trafficking should be prepared and published by the government.

C. Cooperation and networking at the regional and national levels

Cooperation agreements between law enforcement agencies and NGOs

The *General Directorate of Security* of the Turkish Ministry of Interior adopted two Protocols, one with the *HRDF* (04.09.2003) and one with the *Foundation for Women's Solidar-*

ity (31.10.2005). In addition, the *General Commandership of Gendarmerie* entered into a Cooperation Agreement with *HRDF* (14.06.2004).

The objective of these Agreements is *to determine the responsibilities of the partners within the framework of the 'Combating Human Trafficking' Programme*. Law enforcement bodies and NGOs are the partners. The former falls under the category *institutions supporting the programme* and the latter under the category *implementing agencies of the programme*. In addition to introducing preventive measures (awareness-raising, advocacy etc.) and capacity-building measures (training, NGO networking etc.), the Cooperation Agreements between law enforcement and NGOs, focus on victim identification, referral and repatriation of foreign victims of trafficking.

Cooperation agreements between municipalities and NGOs

The *HRDF* has signed a Protocol with the *Metropolitan Municipality of Istanbul* (29.06.2004). Its objective is to *determine the responsibilities of the partners within the framework of 'Opening and Operating Shelters for Female Victims of Trafficking'*.

Networking efforts

The Turkish Government has made networking efforts other than official Cooperation Agreements. Recently, in mid 2006, a meeting with the *representatives of the Embassies* of several countries was initiated by the General Directorate of Security to discuss practical cooperation possibilities and solve existing problems.

NGOs initiate their cooperation and networking with NGOs in other countries. *HRDF* became a member of the *ARIADNE* Network against trafficking in human beings in SE and E. Europe, in June 2005.

D. Mobilization of resources

Donors who provide funds for anti-trafficking programmes are scarce in Turkey. Besides the government of Turkey, including two local administrations, namely *Istanbul Metropolitan Municipality* and *Ankara Metropolitan Municipality*, the *US Government*, the *European Union*, the *World Bank*, *SIDA*, the *Government of Norway* and the *Phillip Morris Inc.* *Altria Funds* have provided funding for several anti-trafficking activities. Also, the *Embassies* of the *Netherlands*, *Denmark*, *Sweden*, *Australia*,

Canada, as well as the British Council, the Catholic Relief Services-Bulgaria and several UN agencies have provided smaller funding for ongoing activities.

Due to the *scarcity of funds*, non-governmental organizations are not very active in the area of combating human trafficking.

Comment

There is an urgent need for national and international donors to provide funds not only for meetings and conferences, but also for practical victim assistance.

IV. Implementation of Anti-Trafficking Laws

A. Prevention and awareness

Various awareness-raising events have been carried out in the last three years in Turkey. Prime Ministry/The General Directorate of the Status of Women has convened three *public events* in 2002, 2003 and 2006. The most recent event, organised by the Directorate in Antalya, was an international conference where representatives of government, non governmental and inter-governmental agencies from Russia, Belarus, Moldova, the Ukraine, Azerbaijan, Georgia, Uzbekistan, Kyrgyzstan and Turkey met and discussed the possibilities of cross border cooperation.

HRDF has organised an *international conference* in Istanbul in 2004 in collaboration with *Catholic Relief Services-Bulgaria* with the participation of representatives of governmental and non-governmental agencies of Moldova, Bulgaria, Romania and Turkey. *Medecins du Monde-Greece*, together with a national NGO, *International Blue Crescent*, has organised two national meetings to address the issue and used the *media* to increase public awareness.

Currently, the variety and amount of *printed material* addressing this area is *limited*. There is a helpline operated by IOM in collaboration with the Turkish Government. IOM has developed and distributed 500,000 passport inserts in Atatürk and Sabiha Gökçen Airports and in Karaköy Seaport in Istanbul, in Antalya Airport and in Trabzon Seaport and also placed billboards in these ports to promote the helpline. More recently IOM has launched a broad media campaign titled '*Have You*

Seen My Mother?. Material on prevention is also being distributed in some of the countries of origin.

B. Protection and assistance

Currently, the aim of the national referral mechanism is the *safe repatriation* of foreign nationals, who become victims of trafficking in Turkey. The referral system does not include cases, in which the victim would stay in Turkey for longer periods of time.

There are two *shelters* providing services to victims of trafficking in Turkey. A trafficked person is referred by the Turkish National Police either to the shelter in Istanbul or to the one in Ankara. There is a Cabinet Decree that regulates to which shelter the trafficked person will be referred once he/she is identified outside of Istanbul and Ankara. Both shelters have secret addresses that are only known to a very limited number of stakeholders.

The *Human Resource Development Foundation* (HRDF), established in 1988, is a Turkish NGO active in the area of population and development with special emphasis on promoting reproductive health/rights, and empowerment of populations under risk. *HRDF* established the first shelter in Turkey for victims of trafficking, in November 2004, in Istanbul. This 10-bed capacity shelter had accommodated more than 260 victims until June 2006.

The shelter in Ankara is operated by the *Foundation for Women's Solidarity* (WFS). This Turkish NGO is rooted in the feminist activist movement. The shelter in Ankara was opened in September 2005 in cooperation with IOM and has a capacity of 11 beds.

Both shelters provide *psychological counselling services* and facilitate access to *free medical services*, providing accommodation and *social assistance*. Repatriation of the victims is ensured by IOM in collaboration with *HRDF* in Istanbul and in collaboration with *WFS* in Ankara. Limited *legal assistance* is provided to the victims with the efforts of NGOs.

Persons trafficked to Turkey may apply for a renewable six-months *humanitarian residence permit*, which is issued by the Turkish National Police Department for Foreigners, Borders and Asylum. The victim's willingness to cooperate with the authorities in the investigation and prosecution of the traffickers is not a precondition for receiving such a permit. The visa can be

extended upon application. However, in Turkey victim assistance measures do not apply for longer stays, something that makes the usage of humanitarian visas problematic.

There is an anti-trafficking *helpline* (157). This helpline is operated by IOM in collaboration with the Turkish Government and works 24 hours a day, 7 days a week. It is operated by Turkish, Russian, Romanian and English speakers and relevant calls are reported directly to the Turkish National Police or to the Gendarmerie by phone or email. The law enforcement agencies take action upon these calls to rescue the persons concerned.

There are also two additional helplines in Turkey, the general police helpline (155) and the gendarmerie helpline (156). These help lines are used primarily by clients of victims to report trafficked persons.

Comments

- Large parts of victim assistance services are currently funded by international sources. A sustainable solution should be developed for the continuity of these services.
- The national referral mechanism should include solutions other than the repatriation of victims under risk.
- Legal counselling services should be part of victim assistance programmes.
- The utilization of government structures for victim assistance is limited. The existing institutions could be modified to be able to better serve the victims of trafficking by ensuring the involvement of NGOs in the process.

C. Prosecution

Judicial authorities: There is no department dedicated to human trafficking cases in the Ministry of Justice; however, judges and prosecutors take national and international training courses and seminars to increase their knowledge in this area.

The existing provisions regulating the *status of victims in criminal proceedings* have limited practical relevance in trafficking cases. Trafficked persons in practice do not participate in court proceedings, due to the fact that they have already returned to their home countries. Victims usually testify at the very beginning of the investigation process while they are still in Turkey. If this is not possible, because the victim has already

left, or if further statements are needed for the prosecution of the case, statements may be obtained by using *channels of international cooperation*. While existing Bilateral Cooperation Agreements (e.g. with the Ukraine or Belarus) allow taking the statement of the witness abroad and transmitting it to Turkish courts, this procedure has yet to be applied in practice. Sometimes it is also impossible to find the victims in their respective home countries.

According to Turkish criminal procedural law, the responsibility to take procedural measures to protect the rights of victims who participate as *witnesses* in criminal proceedings, lies upon the prosecutor. There are measures, such as interviewing the victim-witness in a secret place, keeping his/her identity confidential, interrogating him/her behind a mirror in order to avoid confrontation with the accused or by means of video equipment. The latter technique may also be used, on the basis of Bilateral Protocols, for obtaining witness statements from victims abroad, including trafficked persons who have returned to their home country.

A draft Law on *witness protection*, which also applies to trafficked victim-witnesses, is expected to enter into force in 2006. It covers only those offences with a penalty of more than ten years, which includes trafficking in human beings according to Article 80 of the Criminal Code.

Police authorities: The Turkish Ministry of Interior plays a crucial role in coordinating operational issues with regard to identification, referral of victims and investigation of traffickers. The General Directorate of Security and the General Commandership of the Gendarmerie are responsible for combating human trafficking. Both bodies have special units that deal with foreigners and organised crime. The *Police* and the *Gendarmerie* work closely with non-governmental and international organizations.

The Turkish Government has started an *EU Twinning Project* entitled *Strengthening Institutions in the Fight Against Trafficking in Human Beings*, which is jointly implemented by the Turkish National Police, the Berlin Criminal Police Agency and the Boltzmann Institute of Human Rights in Vienna. The purpose of this 18month project is to prepare Turkey to meet the minimum standards for the suppression of trafficking in human beings, as well as to strengthen the institutions dealing with trafficking, to adopt an anti-trafficking strategy and to implement a sectoral action plan.

Comment

Necessary precautions and modifications in the criminal procedure should be made in order to ensure the participation or representation of the victims in court proceedings.

V. BEST PRACTICES – EXAMPLES

- *Government – NGO Collaboration:* HRDF has initiated its Combating Human Trafficking Programme in 2003 and has approached the Ministry of Interior to sign a Protocol enabling better cooperation and collaboration of the parties in this area. The General Directorate of Security of the MoI responded immediately and positively and a *Protocol* was signed in 2003. Since then, all the victims identified have been referred to HRDF's shelter by the police immediately. The same procedures have been followed one year later with the Ankara shelter upon its establishment.
- *Bilateral Cooperation:* An Azeri woman has been identified as a victim of trafficking in Turkey. It was understood during the interviews that the traffickers were threatening her son who was living in Baku. The Turkish police contacted INTERPOL and the Azeri police, and with their support, the boy was taken to a safe environment. The Azeri victim agreed to cooperate with the Turkish police after she had been informed about this.
- *NGO networking and Government - NGO collaboration:* An NGO from a source country contacted HRDF to make a denunciation. Upon learning the details, HRDF contacted the Turkish police and provided the information. The *Turkish police* conducted a raid to the address provided by the NGO and requested HRDF to send one of its shelter counsellors to assist in the identification process by accompanying the victims.
- *Regional Cooperation:* The *police force of Turkey* together with the *police force of Romania* have organised simultaneous raids at previously identified addresses of traffickers in Bucharest and Istanbul through an operation coordinated under SECI; the traffickers caught in these addresses were arrested.
- *Bilateral Cooperation:* The *Turkish police* acted upon information coming from the Embassy of Belarus. The information provided by the Embassy was combined with a

fastidious investigation and eventually a raid was made and the traffickers were arrested.

VI. DEFICIENCIES

- The application of Article 80 of the Penal Code is not always possible due to the *limited definition* provided in this article. In such cases, the article on prostitution (Article 227) is applied.
- *Training for law enforcement* agencies should be improved.
- Existing *victim identification mechanisms* do not fully guarantee that all victims will be identified and protected.
- There is an *absence of analysis, research and monitoring mechanisms*.
- The utilization of *government structures for victim assistance is limited*.
- There is a *lack of funds* to support victim assistance projects. Major components of victim assistance services are currently funded by international sources.
- The *national referral mechanism* is only limited to the repatriation of victims.
- The *legal counselling system* for victims is underdeveloped.
- *Lack of regional coordination* among competent agencies of the countries of origin and destination may result in re-trafficking and re-victimization.
- The *participation of victims* in *trials* is not ensured. As a result, the prosecution of their traffickers is not effective.

VII. NEEDS ASSESSMENT

Taking into account the deficiencies and comments contained in this report and the need for improvement of the situation, a list of recommendations is provided below.

RECOMMENDATIONS

1. Article 80 should be modified in order to cover all possible forms of human trafficking.

2. The *training of law enforcement* agents should reach larger number of officers given the fact that government employees are obliged to change their posts periodically.
3. *Training* should be continuous and updated training should be scheduled taking into account the progressive mechanisms of combating human trafficking and new instruments developed internationally.
4. The *standardization of the training modules* should be ensured.
5. Better-developed *mechanisms for victim identification* should be established, in order to protect all trafficked persons.
6. The *national mechanism* to combat human trafficking should be restructured to include analysis, research and monitoring mechanisms.
7. *Annual reports* containing information on the number of victims identified, the services provided, training sessions for government officers and the responsible authorities for different aspects of combating human trafficking, should be prepared and published by the government.
8. The *victims assistance government structures* should be modified in order to be able to support victims of trafficking, ensuring the involvement of NGOs in the process.
9. National and international donors should be encouraged to provide *funds* not only for meetings and conferences, but also for practical assistance of victims. A sustainable solution should be developed for the continuity of funding of these services.
10. The *national referral mechanism* should include solutions other than the repatriation of victims at risk.
11. *Legal counselling services* should be developed for the victims.
12. The laws, regulations and services should be *harmonised* within the region and a *communication mechanism* should be established among the countries of origin and destination. This mechanism should also provide the means for the follow up of repatriation and reintegration efforts, in order to avoid re-victimization.
13. Modifications should be made in order to ensure the *participation of the victims in the court proceedings*.

14. Bearing in mind that, due to their vulnerability, refugees and asylum seekers may be subject to trafficking and that trafficked persons may be eligible for *refugee status*, the link between these two regimes should be generally recognised and further developed.

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

AGIS	EU Funded Programme
ARIADNE	NGO Network against Trafficking in Human Beings in SE and E. Europe
GDS	General Directorate of Security
HRDF	Human Resources Development Foundation
ICMPD	International Centre for Migration Policy Development
ILO	International Labour Organization
INTERPOL	International Police
IOM	International Organization for Migration
MoI	Ministry of Interior
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
SECI	Southeast European Cooperative Initiative
SIDA	Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency
TAIEX	Technical Assistance Information Exchange Unit
THB	Trafficking in Human Beings
TIP	Trafficking in Persons
VoT	Victims of Trafficking in Human Beings
USSR	Union of Soviet Socialistic Republics
WFS	Foundation for Women's Solidarity

